

R19-6: Motion to Support the Reintroduction of Out-of-Hours services at the St Andrews Community Hospital

Owner: Nicholas Farrer

In effect from: 16th April 2019

Review: 16th April 2019

Councils Notes:

- 1) One year ago, on Monday the 16th of April 2018, GP out of hours services in Fife changed to be run only at Victoria hospital in Kirkcaldy as a contingency measure reacting to a Fife-wide shortage of GPs.¹
- 2) Over 6,000 people signed a petition to keep the service in St Andrews.²
- 3) Local MPs, MSPs, Councillors, Community Councillors, University staff, and Joint Councils condemned the move and committed to a campaign to resist the closure.³
- 4) In December the Fife Health and Social Care Partnership (FHSCP) acknowledged that there needed to be some out of hours service in St Andrews, and a participation request filed under the Community Engagement Act allowed representatives from NE Fife Community Councils, the University, and the Student's Association to take part in workshops designing the solution the FHSCP would consider.⁴
- 5) The Courier ran an article on March 30th 2019 entitled "*St Andrews out-of-hours GP service thrown possible lifeline*", reading:
*"A proposal which has emerged would see GPs and clinicians based at St Andrews Community Hospital on weekdays until 10pm, on Saturdays from 8am to midnight and on Sundays from 10am to 8pm.
Clinicians would make home visits but the urgent care centre would open when an appointment was necessary.

Details are yet to be finalised but it is expected the option will be presented to the partnership's integration joint board in April for approval."*⁵
- 6) Willie Rennie MSP said "the officials at the Partnership have come up with a smart, innovative solution".⁶

¹ <https://www.fifetoday.co.uk/news/health/frustration-over-decision-to-stop-out-of-hours-service-at-st-andrews-hospital-1-4723240>

² <https://you.38degrees.org.uk/petitions/keep-gp-out-of-hours-services-in-st-andrews?source=facebook-share-button&time=1535537016>

³ <https://www.fifetoday.co.uk/news/health/frustration-over-decision-to-stop-out-of-hours-service-at-st-andrews-hospital-1-4723240>

⁴ <https://www.thecourier.co.uk/fp/news/local/fife/775067/nhs-fife-considers-out-of-hours-participation-request/>

⁵ <https://www.thecourier.co.uk/fp/news/local/fife/859230/st-andrews-out-of-hours-gp-service-thrown-possible-lifeline/>

⁶ <https://www.facebook.com/WillieRennieFife/photos/pb.991011937617366.-2207520000.1554916952./2321929617858918/?type=3&theater>

Councils Believes:

- 1) The closure of GP out of hours services presents a serious threat to the health of all residents of St Andrews, whether they be permanently settled or students.
- 2) The FHSCP should be praised for their work trying to rectify the situation after the initially flawed consultation process.
- 3) The option put before the Integration Joint Board (IJB) in the next few months should be endorsed as a satisfactory solution to this issue, on the basis that:
 - a) North East Fife needs more hours of coverage.
 - b) It's important that staff can open the hospital overnight when triaged appropriately.
 - c) The staffing model emphasising clinicians (over use of GPs) is consistent with the Fife-wide sustainable staffing model that the FHSCP is following.

Councils Resolves

- 1) To enthusiastically endorse an option being put to the IJB by the FHSCP, on the basis of 'Councils Believes: Point 3'.
- 2) To praise the option as an intelligent and satisfactory solution to the problems of the past year.
- 3) For the Association President to issue a press release, making the public aware of this council's resolution.

Proposed:

Nicholas Farrer, Director of Wellbeing

Paloma Paige, Association President

Seconded:

Camilla Duke, Rector's Assessor

Emma Walsh, Member for Student Health

Emily Muller, Member for Students with Disabilities

Appendix 1:

J.18-2: A Motion to Resist the Loss of GP Out of Hours Services at St Andrews Community Hospital

Owner: Nicholas Farrer

In effect from: 18th September 2018

Review: 18th September 2018

Councils Notes:

1. The Fife Health and Social Care Partnership (hereafter 'FHSCP') write "we need to change" with regards to out of hours urgent care. Both new changes proposed by the FHSCP involve making the current closure of GP out of hours services in St Andrews Community Hospital permanent. They propose these overnight services are moved to Kirkcaldy, or both Dunfermline and Kirkcaldy.
2. The FHSCP write: "The urgent care centres described [in both new options] are both within a one-hour drive for everyone in Fife."
3. The majority of students do not own a car nor have one immediately accessible. According to government statistics, only 2% of students aged 17-24 drive to education. (The Office for National Statistics noted that 79% of households have at least one car or van)
4. The University "has decided to actively encourage alternative forms of transport by staff and students rather than the car."
5. After 8:45pm on a weekday, every journey to Kirkcaldy by bus takes at least two hours and requires at least two buses. The last journey of the day departs at 9:30pm and arrives at 11:38pm. The next journey departs 6:05 am the next morning and arrives at 7:20am.
6. One quote for taxi fare from St Andrews to Victoria Hospital, Kirkcaldy on a weekday at 10pm was £65.45.
7. There are no mention of plans for increasing ambulance cover in Fife in the FHSCP proposals.
8. Some staff at the university testify waiting 40 minutes for an ambulance to appear, even in serious emergencies.
9. Principal Sally Mapstone has noted "significant risks" surrounding the move and labelled it a "grave concern".
10. MP Stephen Gethins said that "it is important that local provision is reinstated as quickly as possible."
11. With regards to the closure, North East Fife MSP Willie Rennie said it was "unacceptable that people in east Fife are being treated this way".
12. Chairman of the St Andrews Community Council. Callum McLeod, said: "This news is very disturbing and disappointing indeed.
13. St Andrews Councillors Brian Thompson, Jane Ann Liston, and Dominic Nolan have highlighted concerns about the closure

14. In 2012, 20.5% of the North East Fife population was over 65. 27.5% of the North East Fife population is projected to be over 65 in 2026.
15. The Consultation Period Ends on the 7th of October

Councils Believes:

1. That the permanent closure of GP out of hours services presents a serious threat to the health of all residents of St Andrews, whether they be settled residents, students or staff of the University,
2. The proposed reliance on cars to access out of hours treatment leaves the student population highly vulnerable because the vast majority of students have no access to a car, because of the cost of travel to Kirkcaldy in a taxi is inaccessible to many, and because public transport is sparse during the later hours of the evening.
3. In addition, the proposed reliance on cars leaves many of the town's resident population, particularly the elderly without access to a car, highly vulnerable.
4. The Students Association should condemn the proposals to permanently shut the GP out of hours service at the St Andrews Community Hospital as being extremely dangerous.

Councils Resolves:

1. To urge all students to participate in the consultation process, to state their preference for the 'no change' option, and to explain why any closure places them at risk here. The link is: https://www.fifedirect.org.uk/formFinder/index.cfm?fuseaction=form.Question&Form_id=EC491032-04D7-7F93-DABC1E138656ED18
2. To urge all students to sign any petitions resisting the closure, including: <https://you.38degrees.org.uk/petitions/keep-gp-out-of-hours-services-in-st-andrews?source=facebook-share-button&time=1535537016>
3. To urge any student who has relied on GP out of hours service to write to president@st-andrews.ac.uk and dowell@st-andrews.ac.uk to testify their experience.
4. To urge all students to attend the public consultation meeting on the proposals on Monday the 24th September at 6:45pm in the St Andrews Town Hall.
5. To mandate each individual Councillor and Subcommittee member to complete the consultation.
6. To compel the Sabbatical Officers of the Students Association to cooperate with the University, our MP, our MSPs, our Councillors, the St Andrews Community Council, and the Community Councils of the East Fife area to resist the change however possible.
7. To compel the President to write to the Chair of the Health Board and the Minister for Public Health, Sport and Wellbeing informing them of our position.
8. To compel the President and Director of Wellbeing to organise door-to-door activists to inform our neighbours of the proposals, the consultation, and have them sign the petition - beginning Saturday the 22nd of September.

Proposed by: Nicholas Farrer, Director of Wellbeing

Seconded by: Paloma Paige, Association President;

Jamie Minns, Director of Student Development and Activities;

Adam Powrie, Director of Events and Services;

Alice Foulis, Director of Education;

Fiona Murray, Athletic Union President;

Zelda Tobias-Kotyk, Association LGBT+ Officer

'Councils Notes' Sources:

Points 1, 2 & 7 - (FHSCP) <http://www.fifehealthandsocialcare.org/joiningupcare/out-of-hours-urgent-care-redesign/>

Point 3 - (Government statistics - Students who drive)
https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/306500/young-car-drivers-2012.pdf

Point 3 - (ONS statistics - Households with cars)
<https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/personalandhouseholdfinances/expenditure/datasets/percentageofhouseholdswithcarsbyincomegrouptenureandhouseholdcompositionuktable47>

Point 4 - (University stance on driving) <https://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/environment/sustainabletravel/travellingbycar/studentcars/>

Point 5 - (Bus times)
<https://www.stagecoachbus.com/plan-a-journey/>

Corroborated by Google Maps route finder

Point 6 - (Taxi Fare)
<https://yourtaximeter.com/>

Points 8 & 9 - (Waiting times for ambulances, Principal Sally Mapstone's statement)
<http://www.thesaint-online.com/2018/05/principal-mapstone-labels-closure-of-out-of-hours-gp-services-a-grave-concern/>

Points 10, 11, 12, & 13 - (Statements from local politicians)
<https://www.fifetoday.co.uk/news/health/frustration-over-decision-to-stop-out-of-hours-service-at-st-andrews-hospital-1-4723240>

Point 14 - (Elderly Population in NE Fife)
http://publications.fifedirect.org.uk/c64_fife_locality_profilesnorth_east_fife_170503.pdf

Point 15 - (Consultation end date)
<http://www.fifehealthandsocialcare.org/joiningupcare/introduction-to-the-joining-up-care-proposal/>